

NORTHVILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

June 19, 2013

Wednesday 7:00 P.M. – Northville City Hall - Council Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Johnson called the Historic District Commission meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL:

Present: Argenta, Hoffman, Johnson and Vernacchia

Absent: Field, Luikart and Gudritz (all excused)

Also Present: Jim Allen and Sally Elmiger

3. CITIZEN COMMENTS: Limited to brief comments for items not on the agenda.

Richard Probst, 301 N. Center Street addressed the Historic District Commission regarding his property in Northville and questioned why his property was considered to be within the Historic District. He explained that when recently applying for a permit for roof, siding and windows, he was informed that his two properties were in the Historic District. He said any previous information was inaccurate; he provided a map as documentation; he said he was never notified in 2003 that the boundaries were changed; and the City Clerk was unable to provide confirmation.

Mr. Probst provided photographs of finished renovations at 108 Randolph Street. He spoke about blighted conditions that existed prior to his renovations; noting that now his improvements appear to be causing a problem; he requested that resolution of the situation be expedited.

Chair Johnson referred to the map and legal description, and referred to a similar situation on Wing Street. He said that was the reason the City Council addressed the issue of boundaries. He said he did not know why permits had been issued by the City; but that the subject property was in the Historic District, prior to this inquiry.

Mr. Probst said he made purchase and improvement decisions based upon the information; and said he has owned this house on Randolph for 30 years.

Chair Johnson offered to move the discussion to the end of the meeting.

Mr. Probst said the Historic District Commission by-laws state that another meeting can be called in 48 hours. He expressed the desire to proceed with renovations on his property without lengthy procedural delay.

Discussion took place regarding the Historic District Commission making recommendations to the City Council; possible options, changes to the map, filing the paperwork and applying the application as regular business, etc. It was confirmed that the renovations to the North Center Street property were complete, and that the Randolph property was the subject concern.

4. MINUTES: May 15, 2013

The following change was made to the last page of the minutes: *Member Hoffman* ~~Chair Johnson~~ adjourned the meeting at 8:49 p.m.

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, to approve the minutes of May 15, 2013, as amended.

Voice Vote: Motion Carried unanimously.

5. REPORTS

- A. CITY ADMINISTRATION: None
- B. CITY COUNCIL: None
- C. PLANNING COMMISSIONER: None
- D. OTHER COMMUNITY/GOVERNMENTAL LIAISONS: None

6. CASES

CASE #1
RICHARD & CYNTHIA KERN **NEW ROOF**
124 HIGH STREET

Richard and Cindy Kern, new owners at 124 High Street, explained that their home needs a new roof; the current condition was poor; it was not done correctly years ago; they hope to complete it as soon as possible; and the file contains contractor information. Samples were provided of valleys to replace the membrane; and the colors of the downspouts were as close to identical as the trim color.

Motion by Vernacchia, supported by Argenta, to accept the application as complete.

Commissioner Hoffman confirmed that the owners were required to provide a working smoke alarm; and the Applicant agreed to sign the file relative to same.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Northville Historic District Design Standard 5.9 for asphalt shingles; as presented by the Applicant.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

CASE #2
DAN COMAIANNI/THE NEXT CHAPTER **WINDOW LETTERING**
141 E. MAIN STREET

Applicant Dan Comaianni was present and requested permission for an enhancement to 141 E. Main Street. He said the file showed the proposed improvements.

Motion by Vernacchia, supported by Hoffman, to accept the application as complete.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Argenta, supported by Vernacchia, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Northville Historic District Design Standards 4.24 for signs, leaving the final interpretation of the message units and number of signs to the Building Department; 4.21 for materials; and 5.18 for color; as presented by the Applicant.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

**CASE # 3
TED PETERSON
421 DUBUAR**

NEW ROOF

Ms. Barbara Peterson said she was present for her husband; she provided samples of the proposed shingles; and showed a sample of the old and the new shingles. She said there would be no changes made to any of the gutters; and this was for the roof on both the house and the garage.

Ms. Elmiger indicated that the review was complete. The color proposed was Colonial Blue.

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, to accept the application as complete.
Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Northville Historic District Design Standards 5.9 for asphalt shingles; as presented by the Applicant.
Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

**CASE #4
GREG PRESLEY (Returning)**

ALTERATION & PAINT

129 N. WING STREET

Greg Presley was present, returning with property owner, Sam Khoury.

Commissioner Hoffman provided some background that at the last meeting the Historic District Commission agreed to allow the Applicant to raise the house, and allow a new foundation to be placed under it; and approved the demolition of the back garage. He said tonight the discussion was toward suggestions related to the massing of the structure of the addition.

Mr. Khoury said he followed up since the last meeting; the plan was updated, the massing reduced; the square footage upstairs was reduced, along with and a setback on one of the garages of the two-car garage; a 3-D model was provided to show the improvement; and before and after pictures were provided—two views: one from Wing, one from Dunlap. Mr. Khoury said that due to zoning restrictions, other options were not pursued.

Commissioner Argenta noted that the suggestions were accomplished; the change to the massing made it appear like two garages, and the addition was well delineated.

Commissioner Vernacchia said the proposal was a positive solution.

Motion by Vernacchia, supported by Argenta, to accept the application as complete.
Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Argenta, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Secretary of Interior standards 9 and 10; and Northville Historic District Design Standards 3.16 for mass; 3.17 for height; 3.19 for proportion; 3.20 for hierarchy; 3.21 materials; 3.22 for details; 3.24 for garages; 5.9 for asphalt shingles; 5.14 for windows; 5.17 for siding; 5.18 for paint and color;

Commissioner Argenta suggested the following Northville Historic District Design standards be included: 3.9 for preserving ornament and details; 3.26 for adaptive reuse of historic residential building.

FURTHER, that the approval was conditioned upon the granting of related variances by the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Mr. Khoury said they would agree to the Building Official's final decision as to which or not the matter needed to go before the Board of Zoning Appeals.

Ms. Elmiger said sample materials of the brick were required. Mr. Khoury said has the samples; and he would sign the document regarding the need for a working smoke detector.

Discussion took place regarding the Planning Consultant's review letter relative to supervision being provided regarding the raising of the house, and that the Historic District Commission was encouraging close over-sight by the City in terms of the lifting of the subject house.

Mr. Khoury concurred, and said that significant caution will be exercised, as there was also the neighborhood to consider. Regarding the needed samples, he said he did not know the exact name, but showed the color for use on the chimney portion and a photograph.

The Historic District Commission said that was acceptable, and for the information to be forwarded to Ms. Elmiger.

Mr. Khoury spoke about the colors chosen for the materials, the body of the house, and the trim and sash. (Hale Navy; Cloud White; and Champagne respectively.) He stated that it was decided to remove the lattice work.

MOTION REVISED by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, ~~that the lattice wall will be removed~~ THAT THE LATTICE WORK WILL NOT BE REMOVED; and that Northville Historic District Design standards be included: 3.9 for preserving ornament and details; 3.26 for adaptive reuse of historic residential building; as presented by the Applicant.

The Applicant signed the file relative to the requirement for the inclusion of a working smoke detector.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

Mr. Khoury said he was hopeful to begin the project as quickly as possible, and complete in about two months.

**CASE #5
NORTHVILLE ART HOUSE
215 W. CADY STREET**

PAINT DOORS

Ms. Joan Potter Thomas provided addendums to the Historic District Commission packet. She spoke about the following paint colors for the doors: front door; three different colors for the three other doors; Purple (east, fire escape door); Neon Green and Blue (rear doors near dog park) and that the unique colors would help market the idea of the Art House. She said the 'neighbors' to the west were in the cemetery.

Commissioner Hoffman said the colors were nice colors and were in the same hue tone and were complementary of each other.

**Motion by Vernacchia, supported by Argenta, to accept the application as complete.
Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.**

Commissioner Hoffman clarified that the needs cited on the review were met. Ms. Elmiger confirmed that and the Purple color would be used on the fire escape door on the east side of the building.

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Northville Historic District Design Standards 5.18 for paint and color; as presented by the Applicant.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

CASE #6

**ANDREW KRENTZ
541 LINDEN**

PORCH RAILING

Andrew Krentz explained his proposal for a porch railing; the need to provide security for a small child; and the surrounding properties' railings. He said the material proposed is a molded composite material that is patented and part of a modular system. He said there is a small step-up to the porch; that it made sense to put in a stair and two concrete pads to open up the walkway, which was planned to be commensurate with the scale; and that it would not contain the water faucet. The paint color is White, Sherman Williams Duration, with a matte finish in Pure White. He said they were taking bids from two contractors for the job.

Ms. Elmiger provided a printed copy of her review letter detailing three other pieces, as had been sent to the Applicant, Mr. Krentz said he had not received it.

Mr. Krentz said the rear of the house was form stone; they were not going to do the rear porch; but only the front porch and side; and just the veranda.

Regarding photographs, it was recommended that the Applicant provide photographs of the entire house.

Ms. Elmiger said she provided photographs from the original submission for this house, so the Historic District Commission could see what was approved originally. She said a dimension plan is required, and have not been shown in terms of the railing proposed.

Mr. Krentz said he would like to use whatever dimensions were allowed by the Building Code.

It was agreed that a building permit would be required; so the second item (the height) would be referred to the Building Department.

Regarding the fourth item, the details regarding the dimensions of the house, would be submitted to the Building Department.

**Motion by Vernacchia, supported by Hoffman, to accept the application as complete.
Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.**

Motion by Hoffman, supported by Vernacchia, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Northville Historic District Design Standards 3.10 for porches; 3.21 for materials; 5.18 for paint and color; as presented by the Applicant; and the final height for the railing would be referred to the Building Department for consideration and approval.

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

7. REQUEST FOR A RECOMMENDATION FROM THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION TO THE ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS REGARDING 412 RANDOLPH

Mr. Bob Langan, with Bagley and Langan, PLLC, was present with Greg Presley, and submitted a package to the Historic District Commission to assist in their consideration. He said they were asking the Historic District Commission's recommendation to the Board of Zoning Appeals in their pending variance request from Section 18.11.9 for roof eaves (overhangs and extensions). He said they seek formal approval of this design feature, for a grant of a non-use variance of 16" added to the allowable 14" roof eaves on the east and west sides to allow 30" eaves to remain as-built. He noted that the project received previous approval in 2012 by the Historic District Commission; and that approval acknowledged the 30" variances, but they now want to formalize the matter. He spoke to the site plan and attachments provided of the south elevation of the property; and two photographs showing the dentals and overhangs and a south elevation photograph; and a photograph taken yesterday, showing the streetscape.

Greg Presley spoke about the architectural review from October; the desired four -square design on the plain rectangular building; the simple form that is their intention; the houses on either side; and that they want to step it back on this narrow lot. He spoke about the four square design, and that part of its character is the wide overhangs, which 'sits the house down.' He said the roof stops the wall; they have created something that is complementary to the neighborhood; the upper sketch is from October, the lower photograph was taken today; and they were asking the Historic District Commission to recommend to the Board of Zoning Appeals that they endorse this architecture with these overhangs.

Commissioner Argenta confirmed that there were vertical projections on the chimneys and window projections. He said the proposal echoes the simple building style, in historic perspective; the variation of the dentals were almost like an Arts and Crafts bungalow style; the proportion is right; it fits in; and he had no problem recognizing that the proposed overhang was essential to the architectural style of the dwelling.

Commissioner Vernacchia said he had no problem with the proposal. Commissioner Hoffman concurred.

Motion by Argenta, supported by Hoffman, that the Historic District Commission recommend to the Board of Zoning Appeals that the variance regarding 412 Randolph be approved, as the 30" overhang is essential and consistent with the four-square style of architecture, which is the architectural design of this house

Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Richard Probst, 301 N. Center Street

The Historic District Commission discussed the subject matter.

Commissioner Argenta recalled asking Ms. Elmiger about the subject property; and her email regarding same, noting that the house on the northwest corner has been repairing their foundation and siding was being removed without Historic District Commission approval. He said construction has continued for four weeks since then.

Commissioner Hoffman noted that changing map would take considerable time; or the Applicant could apply for the paperwork in order to be heard and considered by the Historic District Commission as an agenda item.

Discussion took place regarding the situation; Chair Johnson said it was a City Council issue to amend Historic District boundaries, and recalled details regarding the boundary discussions. He suggested an expedited consideration of the matter.

Discussion ensued by the Historic District Commission regarding the subject matter. Discussion took place regarding possible special meeting dates. The Commission agreed to meet on June 26, 2013.

Motion by Vernacchia, supported by Argenta, that the Historic District Commission holds a special meeting on June 26, 2013 to address the 108 Randolph petition for application.
Voice Vote: All. Nays: None. Motion Unanimously Carried.

DISCUSSION

None

ADJOURN

Chair Johnson adjourned the meeting at 8:16 p.m.

Respectfully submitted, Cindy Gray, Recording Secretary